

WEST TISBURY PERSONNEL BOARD  
MINUTES  
December 9, 2019

**Present:** Leon Brathwaite, Ben Retmier, and Dianne Powers

**Absent:** Norm Perry and Rachel Rooney

**Also present for all or part of the meeting:** Dawn Barnes, Joan Chavez, Rhonda Conley, Beth Kramer, Kathy Logue, and Skip Manter

The meeting was called to order at 5:07PM.

The minutes of the December 2 meeting were tabled to the next meeting.

**Performance Evaluations:** A motion was made and seconded to approve the following performance evaluations for Philip Hollinger and Garrison Vieira (Police) each with a one- step increase. The evaluation for Ernie Chavez (Park & Rec) was also accepted. All in favor.

**New Business**

**FY2021 Budget:** A motion was made and seconded to approve the FY2021 Budget and Budget Submission sheet. All in favor.

**Old Business:**

**Classification and Compensation Study:** Review of appeals

A letter from Human Resources Services dated December 9 regarding the consultants comments on the appeal applications are noted below for the record.

**Library:** The consultant did not agree with the revisions set forth in the appeal. She suggested that the library provide the board with a letter regarding the education requirement. She noted that a library technician is a “somewhat different job than a circulation assistant” which is the position she reviewed.

The follow factor ratings were adjusted based on the proposed changes to the job description on appeal of the consultant’s determination.

- Education: The description currently says high school diploma with a Bachelor’s Degree preferred. The appeal asks to change this to a Bachelor’s degree required.

Dianne said she did not agree that this position requires a minimum of a Bachelor’s Degree. Beth explained that she looked at current qualifications for this position across the state by talking to the Massachusetts Library Association. The request to change the education is because a big part of the work is the technology. Beth said that she has found that staffs that don’t have college degree struggle with learning the technology. It was noted that the employee questionnaires show that 5 employees said high school diploma was required and 5 said college or some advanced training was required.

Ben said his concern is that if a Bachelor’s Degree is required it may be restrictive.

After a lengthy discussion the rating for this factor was unchanged. Dianne said if Beth submitted a letter from the Library Association she would reconsider this decision.

- Interactions with others/customer service: Confidentiality: Leon said the two factors he wanted to look at are interaction with others/customer service and confidentiality. Dianne said that faxing personal materials should not count as handling confidential materials. Beth said that all circulation assistants are trained to do medical records searches and help people find resources related to medical issues. There is also a privacy issue regarding the types of materials people check out. Factor changed from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree.
- Occupational Risk: Assistant Librarians are all at 1<sup>st</sup> degree. The IT Librarian is at the 2<sup>nd</sup> degree because of work with computer hardware. Changed from 1<sup>st</sup> to 2<sup>nd</sup> degree. The total rating was increased to 185.

Beth's withdrew her request to change the title of this position at this time.

A motion was made and seconded to approve changing the Circulation Assistant position from Grade 1 to Grade 2. All in favor.

**Assistant Treasurer/Collector:** The consultant did not endorse further edits to the position or the need to change the minimum level of education.

The following factor ratings were adjusted based on the Board's review of the revised job description on appeal and interpretation of the rating manual.

- Knowledge, Training & Education: Requesting that a Bachelor's Degree be required instead of preferred. Increased from 2<sup>nd</sup> degree to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree.
- Experience: Change from 3<sup>rd</sup> to 4<sup>th</sup> degree.
- Occupational Risk: it was noted that most positions were at 1<sup>st</sup> degree. Ben said that perhaps the board should look at this rating for all positions. Increased to 2<sup>nd</sup> degree.
- Supervision Given: Request addition for supervision of lock box and Deputy Collector in the absence of the Treasurer/ Collector: increased from 1<sup>st</sup> degree to 2<sup>nd</sup> degree.
- Supervision Scope: Increased from 1<sup>st</sup> to 2<sup>nd</sup> degree { Note that this makes it the same as the Treasurer/ Collector }
- Judgement & Initiative: Increased from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree.
- Accountability: Increased from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree

The changes bring the total points for this position to 328.

Staff raised a question of the original intent of this position. She said it was her understanding that by combining treasurer and collector departments over expenses would be reduced. Moving this position to Grade 8 will make these positions almost co-equal on the wage scale. Kathy replied that now that the position has been in place for a year, these changes to the job description are appropriate.

A motion was made and seconded to move this position from Grade 5 to Grade 8. All in favor.

After the vote, it was noted that this would place this position on the par with positions of the, Council on Aging Director, Health Agent, and Library Director Positions all of which have been moved from Grade 7 to Grade 8 by the consultant. The Building Inspector and Police Sergeant positions are also on Grade 8.

**Affordable Housing Administrative Assistant:** The consultant moved this position from Grade 3 to Grade 4 under the title Administrative Assistant II. In her opinion, the additional description changes do not warrant moving the position higher on the classification plan.

There were several requested edits to the job description that resulted from the board's discussion with Rhonda at the December 2 meeting.

The following factor ratings were changed based on the Board's review of the revised description on appeal.

- Experience: Increased from 3<sup>rd</sup> to 4<sup>th</sup> degree.
- Confidentiality: Increased from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree
- Supervision Received: Increased from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree
- Supervision Given Increased from 1<sup>st</sup> to 2<sup>nd</sup> degree

Total points of 293 would place this at Grade 6. A motion was made and seconded to move this position from Grade 4 to Grade 6. All in favor.

Rhonda asked if this position is being changed to a Board Administrator position and if so, will the position have to be advertised. Ben answered that at the moment, the board has only changed the grade. If the title is changed then the position will have to be advertised.

After this vote, it was noted that the administrative position for the Community Preservation Committee was also moved from Grade 3 to Grade 4, but that the CPC did not file an appeal. Maria asked if this will create an internal inequity. Ben replied that they will look at the CPC rating at the next meeting. Maria was instructed to invite the CPC to attend.

**Principal Assessor:** There was one requested change to the job description on appeal that errors could result in the loss of new growth affecting the levy ceiling. The primary basis for the requested appeal is that all financial positions in town should be on the same grade.

The consultant did not recommend increasing the grade because the additional wording did not have an impact on the factor rating for accountability. Further, the consultant did not recommend changing the grade on this position because employees do not determine the makeup of a town's financial team. The board's rating changes are based on their interpretation of the rating manual.

- Problem Solving Skills and Effort .There was some discussion about whether this should be rated at the 5<sup>th</sup> degree. It was noted that no position in town was given the 5<sup>th</sup> degree for this rating. It was determined that it should remain at the 4<sup>th</sup> degree.
- Experience: Changed from 4<sup>th</sup> to 5<sup>th</sup> degree based on current job description.
- Interactions with Others/ Customer Service: Moved from 3<sup>rd</sup> to 4<sup>th</sup> because the Principal Assessor does receive taxpayer financial information for exemptions and abatements.
- Supervision Given: Changed from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree
- Supervision Scope: Changed from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree

These changes would place the position on Grade 10. Dawn said she is only asking for the position to be on par with the Treasurer/Collector and the Town Accountant.

The board went back over some of the factors and determined that the supervision given rating should be the same as the Treasurer/Collector and Town Account so it was moved back to the 2<sup>nd</sup> degree bringing the total rating within the Grade 9 range.

A motion was made and seconded to place this position on Grade 9 with a total rating of 393 points. All in favor.

**Assistant Director Counsel on Aging:** The consultant concurred with the requested appeal and recommended that the position be placed at Grade 5 on par with her rating of the Assistant Treasurer/Collector [and the Head of Circulation/Assistant Library Director] who also supervises the department in the absence of the department head.

Upon review of the appeal paperwork and proposed additional revisions to the job description the following rating factors were revised:

- Physical Environment increased from 1<sup>st</sup> degree to 2<sup>nd</sup> degree
- Experience: Based on the 2- 4 years of experience rating changed from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree. Mistakenly thought that was increased from 10 to 20 point by the consultant. It's an increase of 30 points from 10 to 40.
- Interactions with Others/ Customer Service: Outreach Coordinator is 3<sup>rd</sup> degree and Director is 4<sup>th</sup>. Moved to 4<sup>th</sup> degree
- Occupational risk: Job description revisions increase this rating from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree. It was noted that the Outreach Coordinator factor rating is 2<sup>nd</sup> degree.
- Supervision Given: Increased from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree. Puts it on par with Director
- Accountability: Increased from 2<sup>nd</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> degree.

A motion was made and seconded to move this position from Grade 4 to Grade 6 with a total of 298 points. All in favor.

**Board Administrators:** Members reviewed the December 9 email from the consultant regarding how classification of the Board Administrator position. In part, the email states that "board administrators should fall on one grade and not be spread amongst different grades otherwise it would cause inequity among the group of positions." She did not need see a need to create a Board Administer II position. In conversation with the board, the consultant said the wage study showed that these positions are underpaid in relation to the market.

The board did not like that there is only one rating sheet for all the Board Administrator positions. In 2015, the consultant prepared a separate rating sheet was done for each board Administrator position , and while the point totals were varied, all the positions fell within the Grade 6 range.

Dianne said she doesn't like that the change was based on market data and thinks this will create problems going forward. Ben felt the consultant changed the ratings to match the market data.

Leon suggested that the members review and grade each of the board administrator descriptions at the next meeting. The staff and board members will be invited to attend. If the respective boards disagree with the decision of the board, they will have the opportunity to appeal the board's decision.

**The following documents were signed:**

- Job Certification Forms:  
COA/ Temporary Hire/Outreach Coordinator  
Park & Rec/ Winter Rec and Chess Instructors
- Noted for the Record:  
Approval of vacation carry-over: Police

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 7:45 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

Maria McFarland  
Board Administrator  
APPROVED